Calque in Diplomatic Condolence Messages: The Case of Reina Terrorist Attack

Diplomatik Taziye Mesajlarında Öyküntü: Reina'ya Terör Saldırısı Örneği

Nihal Yetkin KARAKOÇ*

Öz

Taziye mesajları literatürde bugüne dek kültürel ve kültürlerarası yönlerden incelenmiş, ancak diplomatik taziye mesajları, yazarın incelediği kadarıyla, bir calısma haric ele alınmamıştır. Bu anlamda, bu calısma kendi türünde bir ilk olma özelliğini taşır ve odağını ceviribilim cercevesinde bir terör saldırısı sonrasında yazılan tazive mesajlarının Türkçe çevirisinde tesbit edilen öyküntü yapılar oluşturmaktadır. Bu doğrultuda, bütünce için amaçlı örneklem kullanılmış, internet kaynaklarından 2017 yılına girerken yeni yıl kutlamaları sırasında İstanbul'da ünlü bir gece kulübü olan Reina'ya yapılan terör saldırısı sonrasında dünyanın her yerinden liderlerin göndermiş olduğu ve doğrudan alıntılar ile medvada yayımlanan otantik taziye mesajları taranarak secilmiştir. Asağıdaki araştırma soruları işlevselci bir bakış açısı ile incelenmiştir: i. Türkçede bir terör saldırısı sonrasında yazılan diplomatik taziye mesajlarında tipik olarak izlenen makroyapı ve kesit nedir? ii.2017'e girerken, yeni yıl kutlamaları sırasında Türkiye'de, İstanbul'da, Reina'ya yapılan terör saldırısı örneğinde medyada yer alan çevirilerde kesit çerçevesinde karşımıza çıkan gelenek dışı kullanımlar, varsa, nelerdir? İlk araştırma sorusu için Tulun'da (1996) şablon olarak yer verilen taziye mesajları esas alınmış, ikinci araştırma sorusu için de Silva-Corvalán'ın (1994) belirlediği sınıflandırmanın birkaç basamağının, bu çalışmanın yazarı tarafından genişletilmiş olan versiyonu temelinde analiz vapılmıştır. Calışma, ilk araştırma soruşundan hareketle, her iki dilde taziye mesajlarındaki yerleşik makroyapıyı ve kesiti saptamaktadır. İkinci aşama olarak ise, bu tipik kullanımlar ışığında, medyada yer alan Türkçe diplomatik taziye mesajlarındaki kesitte yer alan gelenek dışı dilsel kullanımlara, yani öyküntülere ışık tutmaktadır. Sonuç olarak elde edilen verilerin hem diplomatik metin çevirisi eğitimi ile uygulamasına, hem de dilbilime yansımaları olacağı değerlendirilmektedir.

Anahtar sözcükler: Taziye mesajı, kesit, öyküntü, diplomatik dil

Abstract

In the literature, condolence messages in the context of natural death were scrutinised from cultural and crosscultural aspects. However, diplomatic condolence messages were not investigated, with one exception, to the best knowledge of the author. The present study is the first of its kind and its focus is on the calques detected in the Turkish translations of condolence messages following a terrorist attack in light of translation studies. To this end, with purposive sampling, the internet was searched for authentic condolence messages from diplomatic sources, published with direct quotations, after the terrorist attack to a famous night club, Reina, in Istanbul, Turkey, on the New Year's Eve, 2017. By taking a functionalist approach, the following research questions were analyzed: i. What is the typical macrostructure and register followed in the diplomatic messages of condolence after a terrorist attack in English and Turkish?, ii. What are the unconventional uses in register, if any, in the media translation in the case of terror attack to Reina, Turkey during the new year celebrations of 2017? For the first question, this study drew on condolence messages given as template in Tulun (1996), whereas for the second one, on Silva-

^{*} Yrd. Doç.Dr, İzmir Ekonomi Üniversitesi, Fen-Edebiyat Fakültesi, Mütercim Tercümanlık Bölümü, "mailto:nihal.yetkin@ieu.edu.tr" nihal.yetkin@ieu.edu.tr

Corvalán's (1994) categorization modified by the author. The study by identifying the established macrostructure and register in such messages in both languages first, indicates the unconventional linguistic uses, being calques in diplomatic register in Turkish media translations of condolence messages, which would have implications for diplomatic text translation training and practice as well as linguistics.

Keywords: Condolence message, register, calque, diplomatic language

Introduction

Diplomatic language refers to three layers of language in Nicholson's (1950) terms: language used in diplomatic correspondences/dialogues; professional language peculiar to diplomats, and language used by diplomats to avoid taking a tactless and provocative stance. The first relates to the lingua franca or working languages in the diplomatic world, the second relates to the terminology used by diplomats, and the third is concerned with the linguistic uses required by the diplomatic context. This study focuses on the second and third, which are actually intertwined. For more details and examples, see Yetkin (2016).

Diplomatic language, as a means of communication, is considered to be a more refined form of a language. As Abu Jaber (2001, pp. 50-51) put, "to say the right thing at the right time is as important as saying the right thing".

The condolence messages constitute an important type of diplomatic texts, which require, and are readily given the attention of international community. In literature, condolence messages were scrutinised from cultural (Yahya, 2010; Tareq, 2013; Lotfollahi and Eslami-Rasekh, 2011; Samavarchi and Allami, 2012; Kuang, 2015) and crosscultural (Elwood, 2004; Behnam, Ali Akbari and Goharkhani (2013) aspects. However, interestingly, only one study investigated diplomatic condolence messages (Fenton-Smith, 2007) to the best of the author's knowledge. Unlike the said former linguistic studies, which focused on messages sent after cases of natural death, this study focuses on condolence messages/correspondences after a terrorist attack.

To this end, an internet search was conducted for authentic messages, and a total of 39 authentic messages were selected from international diplomatic figures in response to the terrorist attack to a famous night club, Reina, in Istanbul, Turkey, on New Year's Eve, 2017. The messages were analyzed in terms of macrostructure and/or register.

The research questions are as follows:

- 1. What are the macrostructure and register features of diplomatic condolence messages after the terrorist attacks in English and Turkish?
- 2. What are the unconventional uses seen in the register of Turkish translations of the condolence messages sent by world leaders in the wake of the attack to Reina, a night club in Istanbul, Turkey during the new year celebrations of 2017, from the functionalist perspective?

Limitations

For the purposes of this study, condolence messages written after a death from natural causes such as illness, aging are excluded, and only the analysis of the macrostructure and register of condolence messages was made, following the general points used in the source text analysis by Nord (1997, pp. 62-67).

Only the messages/correspondences with direct quotations in the news agencies/websites were taken as the source text or text excerpt, along with their Turkish translations for the register analysis. Summarized messages were excluded, as Schäffner and Bassnett (2010, p.2) stated, "Media reports about political events are always forms of recontextualisation, and any recontextualisation involves transformations". If indirect quotations from the messages were also included, it would be impossible to know the original words, as the editor of the related website might make some changes in the message due to technical, ideological, spatial or other factors.

The unconventional uses which were not peculiar to diplomatic condolences in the said messages were also excluded, to ensure a clear focus on the shifts from the diplomatic uses, if any.

Literature Review

Translation in the media

The political/diplomatic texts in the Media are ideological, whether they are conveyed to the readers through direct quotation or not, because it is a mediated text (Schäffner, 2007). One of the fundamental problems in analyzing the texts in the Media is the identity of the translator. It is not possible to claim that there is only a single translator as the translation can be shaped by different professionals, including translator/journalist/reviewer/editor. These are regarded as gatekeepers as they are the ones to decide what items to include in the news stories, and what angle to emphasize (Bruce and Douglas, 2008, p.507). Even if there is a professional translator in the team, the identities of these professionals are so inseparable (Bulut, 2008, p. 110) and the translator can assume multiple identities (Bulut, 2015, p. 50). The collaborative work of translation and editing has even been encapsulated in a term: transediting, blending the name of these two acts (Stetting, 1989). In addition, translations in the media can be made by multiple translators, which constitutes a collective translation, especially common in translations for non-governmental organizations. Another problem in analyzing media translations is the issue of intertextuality. The news may not be based siply on a single text and its translation, in other words, as Bassnett (2011) remarked, the pieces presented as translations may in fact be a combination of translations of texts excerpted from different sources. This situation has led to the embedded nature of translations in texts, and thus the convergence of the acts of creation and recreation (van Doorslaer, 2010). All these possibilities compel us to reconsider the nature of the "translator's intervention" as media translation is a collective process and product.

Calque in Literature

A calque is a "term used to denote the process whereby the individual elements of an source language (SL) item (e.g. morphemes in the case of a single word) are translated literally to produce a target language (TL) equivalent" (Shuttleworth and Cowie 2007, pp. 17-1).

Vinay and Darbelnet (1958/1972) see calque as a type of Direct Translation, and one of seven translation procedures, and define it as "a particular kind of borrowing where a phrase is borrowed from one foreign language, and its component parts are translated". Odlin (1993, p. 37) does not use this seemingly neutral definition, given in Vinay and Darbelnet's (1958/1972) Model, and sees calque as "error", which "reflect very closely a native language structure." Sewell (2001) chooses

a euphemistic version of error to define calque when she refers to it as "inappropriate very close translation into (TL), using TL forms, of source language (SL) forms".

Some examples which were originally calques may become standardized cultural equivalents of their SL models (Shuttleworth and Cowie 2007, p. 18), whereas some others can never be considered acceptable in TL, for linguistic/extralinguistic reasons. Some even force the limits of intelligibility (Yetkin Karakoç, 2014).

Pym's (2014) article revisiting Vinay and Darbelnet's (1958/1972) typology from the perspective of the politics of translation solutions is noteworthy in claiming that a description of the translator's basic toolkit as provided by these two linguists is politically influenced, and "formulated in a context ideologically ruled by two master languages considered equal in strength and resources".

Speaking of the calques under which these "ideological" frames are created, Chesterman (1988, p. 69) attributes the emergence of calque to two main factors, one being the insufficient knowledge of the foreign language, and the other, being self translation of L1 material as he assumes that when looking for solutions, translators tend first to consider those resources in the TL that are perceived as being similar to the SL. Sewell (2001) claims that a target language (TL) calque might stem from the choice of a cognate or a false friend as in "collège" in French, being translated as "college" in English. Kayyal (2008, p. 43) believes that it occurs due to the lack of the culture-specific items in TL and/ or the tendency to translate in isolation each word in idiomatic combinations without taking into account the word's function in the context. This results in semantic deviation from the source text, as well as the construction of incomprehensible phrases in target text. Others such as Chansou (1984) considers calquing as the creative power capable of conveying new concepts to new target audiences, and developing the TL vocabulary. Similarly, Silva-Corvalán (1994) regards calques as innovative as the usages she analyzed are not observed in American Spanish outside the contact zone.

Literature abounds in categorizations of calques, (among the others, by Otheguy and García (1993); Silva-Corvalán (1994); López Minett (1999) and Rodríguez (1999), as cited in Braga and Domínguez (2010), Garnier and Dizier (2009) and Braga and Domínguez (2010). Otheguy and García (1993, as cited in Bivin, 2013, p.14) do not "specifically focus on the use of calques, but rather utilize "contact neologism" as a term that encompasses loan words, one word switches, and calques". López Minett (1999) and Rodríguez (1999) in Braga and Domínguez (2010) classify calques as morphological, syntactic and lexical. Garnier and Dizier (2009) analyze them under lexical, lexical choice, structural and style calques. Silva-Corvalán's (1994) categorization given below includes a separate class of collocational calques, which is more appropriate for the data analyzed here.

At this point, what Pym's (2014) statements regarding the categorization problems in Vinay and Darbelnet's (1958/1972) translation solutions, can apply to all the calque categorizations in literature. This can be attributed to the fact that the examples are unrepresentative, and inadequate in number and/ or the definitions are not sufficiently clear. What is more striking is that the categorizations in literature are based on structurally similar languages. The language pair in this study, however, is English-Turkish, which belong to different language families with the consequent structural differences. So, the related classifications need to be revised to address the gaps arising from such differences, a finding unearthed by Polat (2015) in analyzing direct translation processes and softening of refusals through another structurally different language pair, Turkish-French. He illustrated this point with sentences such as "Tu peux demander au docteur"- "Doktora sorabilirsin". Here, the translation in

Turkish, as an agglutinative language, does not allow the modal (pouvoir)+ infinitive, which leaves the following question unanswered: is the process applied in translation an example of calque or literal translation, a problem posed by Vinay and Darbelnet's (1958/1972) classification which sees these two as separate solution. Therefore, in this study, we use the classification of Silva-Corvalán (1994), in which she saw relexification as part of lexico-syntactic calques, instead of two separate categories, and considered relexification as a sentential pattern.

Following the definitions, the author added/modified some categories by Silva-Corvalán for future use through additional descriptions accompanied by examples from different languages:

- 1. Single word or one-word calques: being similar to other types of borrowing, it involves the transference of the meaning of a word into a pre-existing lexical item. This description is reminiscent of partial false friends. Ex: sympathy –sempati
- 2. Multiple word calques: these are calques which do not alter the semantic and/or grammatical features of the replica language (TL). They mean the same but sound unnatural in the target language. Ex: workdays- dias de trabaja
- 3. Multiple word calques of bound collocations, idioms or proverbs: these are reproduced exactly by lexical units from the replica language. Here, the extent of collocations was modified to cover i. restricted collocations (motherly care-annece bakım), bound collocations (ex.any idiom and its literal translation) as well as established collocations where phrases in the couplet share the basic semantic features, ex. Ladies and Gentlemen -hanimefendiler ve beyefendiler. This means, in this study, multiple word calques of every type of collocation, not just bound collocation, were included.
- 4. Lexico-syntactic calques: Lexico-syntactic calques appear when a foreign pattern or meaning is brought into a second language while retaining the morphemes of the first language. In other words, it alters semantic or grammatic features of the second language. They are divided into six subgroups:
- i. A multiple word unit which reproduces a phrase in the source language brings about a change in the meaning of a word in the replica language, ex: call one back-geri dönmek. "Dönmek" implies "geri" in Turkish so the word "geri" is not needed as a separate lexical item. It was introduced into Turkish through translations.
- ii. A multiple word unit which reproduces a phrase in the source language brings about a change in combinatorial restrictions, ex: knowing how to speak- nasıl konuşmayı bilmek. Actually, "konuşmayı" is not used in this syntactic construction in Turkish.
- iii. Calques which respond to prepositional phrases in the source language that are reproduced with lexical units of the replica language, but with the prepositions that correspond to SL phrase, thus causing changes in combinatorial restrictions, ex. The redundant and misuse of "için", derives from "para los niños" in Spanish, as in some other languages. Frequently, the dative case marker "– (y)A" is an adequate replacement, as in the case of "çocuklar<u>a</u> faydalı", not "çocuklar <u>için</u> faydalı." …

- iv. The subcategorization of a verb in the replica language changes following the model of source language, for example, the verb's being transitive/intransitive, ergative, reflexive is translated so as to copy the model in the source language, ex: change of "gustar"'s (in Spanish) use with the effect of English. "Gustar" is subcategorized for a subject with the semantic role of theme and an indirect object with the role of the experiencer, yet in English it is not.
- v. A pragmatically marked word order in the replica language becomes unmarked, by reproducing the corresponding neutral word order in the source language, ex: in cases where a verb in the source language is used actively, but is used passively in the replica, TL language.
- vi. Relexification (similar to literal translation in Vinay and Darbelnet's (1958/1972) terms): These are calques creating syntactic structures nonexistent in the replica language. The copying here is extended to cover the whole sentential structure, not necessarily meaning the exact copying of word order. The typical example given by Vinay and Darbelnet (1958/1972) is: L'encre est sur la table (French). The ink is on the table (Eng). They stated that literal translation may be unacceptable for the translator when it gives a different or no meaning, when it is impossible for structural reasons, when it does not have a corresponding expression within the metalinguistic experience of the TL and when it corresponds to something at a different level of language (as cited in Munday, 2001, p.57).

Theoretical Framework and Method

This exploratory article identifies the points to be considered during the diplomatic condolence messages/correspondences, taking a functional approach. The text type examined here is *Expressive* in Reiss's (1977/1989) terms as its purpose is self-expression, in this case, extending sympathies to the addressee(s).

To analyze the first research question, it is important to closely examine the translation of messages as a diplomatic text type, in this case, using the steps listed by Nord (1997, pp. 62-67) to be considered in analysis of source text i.e. condolence message analysis. The steps were, namely, the issue, the content, the presuppositions, (extralinguistic elements about the communication milieu), nonverbal elements, diplomatic language (linguistic use peculiar to diplomacy), sentential structure, stylistic punctuation and features, and composition, in this context, text structure. This study is focused on the structure, which includes macrostructure and register. Macrostructure refers to the parts of the messages, whereas Register refers to conventional use of words and phrases. In diplomatic messages, such uses may be grouped under address forms, use of adjectives for reinforcing feelings as well as emphasizing sincerity, and concise, formal wording. As our research questions can be scrutinised under the fourth step, which is composition, involving macrostructure and register, the analysis was conducted accordingly.

Regarding the first research question as to the identification of the macrostructure and the register of the corpus, this study drew on condolence messages given as a template (Tulun, 1996, pp.44-46).

For the second research question regarding the unconventional uses in register, translation strategies in literature were analyzed. Purposive sampling was used to gather 39 authentic messages from the international diplomatic sources chosen from the internet, following the terrorist attack to

a famous night club, Reina, in Istanbul, Turkey, on the Eve of the new year, 2017. As the diplomatic language is replete with lingua franca throughout history as well as established patterns varying from the lexical to sentential level, calques and literal translation were visible.

Regarding error notion in translations from the functionalist perspective, the errors were defined, not in formal terms of correct and incorrect, but rather, in pragmatic terms of adequate or inadequate, regarding the function to be fulfilled by the text and the target reader (Nord, 1997, p. 35).

The Study

The event upon which the condolence messages/correspondences are based

The 2017 started badly for the Turkish people as Reina, one of the most famous night clubs in İstanbul, has been the target of a terrorist attack, resulting in 39 fatalities. Messages poured in to comfort and support Turkey in its struggle against terrorism.

Findings and Discussion

I. Macrostructure and register of diplomatic messages of condolence after a terrorist attack

The condolence messages can be observed in the form of an official letter of condolence sent by mail/e-mail or a formal correspondence published on social media such as Twitter, and/or formal websites of diplomatic institutions, news agencies etc. The social media messages follow the general diplomatic pattern as summarized above, yet they tend to be shorter, as compared to the messages of condolences as official letters. No other diplomatic correspondence follows as strict a form as diplomatic invitation cards, therefore, the condolence messages are more flexible in the number of paragraphs, and length, but the features of diplomatic register are expected in such correspondence.

The macrostructure can be traced through numbered parts, and register can be seen through exclusive linguistic use for each part below.

1.Expressing Sympathy

In this section, information on time and the location of the incident is submitted, expressing deep sorrow. The attack is preceded by emotionally charged adjectives like "dastardly", "despicable", "deplorable", "horrible", "brutal" in English, and "alçak", "hain", "korkunç", "zalim" in Turkish. The sender offers his/her sympathy, and implies that s/he has written the message immediately after learning about the incident.

(1) It is a tragedy that, member of the Embassy inhas been the victim of a dastardly terrorist attack (...... Büyükelçiliği çalışanı'ın elim bir terörist saldırısı sonucunda hayatını kaybettiğini büyük bir üzüntüyle öğrenmiş bulunuyorum.)

2. Commitment to cooperation and struggle against terrorism to prevent further incidents

(2) Terrorism is a scourge of our age, which requires international cooperation to combat (Terörizm çağımızın sorunu olup, uluslararası işbirliğiyle mücadele edilmesi gereken bir konudur.)

3. Closing remarks with comforting words to the recipients of the message

(3)shares in the grief of the families of the deceased and extends to them and to the government and people ofour heartfelt sympathy. (.....olarak hayatını kaybedenlerin ailelerine taziyelerimizi bildirir, kendilerine ve'nın hükümeti ve halkının acılarını paylaştığımızı bildiririz.)

There is little flexibility in this part, the adjectives preceding the words like "grief" and "sympathy" may vary. There is a tendency to avoid the word "die" and its other word forms, "death" "the dead" in English and "ölüm", "ölen" "ölmek" in Turkish are not used. The euphemistic words like "passing", "pass away", "deceased" in English and "aramızdan ayrılan", "hayatını kaybeden", "merhum", "müteveffa" in Turkish are prefered to be diplomatically correct.

The comforting words may be conveyed personally or on behalf of other bodies. In such a case, senders put themselves in the second place as an indicator of humbleness.

(4) On behalf of the Turkish nation and on my behalf, let me extend deepest sympathies for the deceased (Türk milleti ve kendi namıma, hayatını kaybetmiş olmasından duymuş olduğum derin üzüntüyü bildirmek isterim.)

II. Unconventional uses in register in the Turkish translations of diplomatic condolence messages written after a terrorist attack

After a review of dozens of condolence messages, a total of 39 diplomatic messages/statements from 24 different countries and 6 international organizations were

analyzed. Although the lengths of the messages differ, they are generally brief. All follow the same macrostructure and register features, though shorter messages omitted some of the parts analyzed under the first research question. However, all messages are appropriate for the second research question about the register, referring to special linguistic uses. The messages analyzed included those from the President/Foreign Minister/Prime Minister of Italy, Australia, Hungary, South Korea, Israel, Azerbaycan, Greece, France, Canada, Austria, Georgia, Qatar, Kazakhistan, Iran, Germany, UK, Norway, Kosovo, USA, Belgium, Iraq, Pakistan, Russia, Sweden. Other messages were from international organizations of European Parliament, NATO Secretariat General, EU Foreign Policy High Representative Office, EU Secretariat General, EU Commission and subgroups, and Council on American-Islamic relations. There were far more messages sent by world leaders/top level executives than those included in the study, but on the internet, summaries are often given rather than the messages themselves. Only those with direct quotations both in English and Turkish texts were included in the study. Besides, as this is a qualitative, not a quantitative study, the identically same Turkish translations for some collocations or sentential patterns in different messages were excluded. Only examples of different calques and literal translations are given here. The full version of each message can be accessed through the numbered links at the end of the article.

The data indicated the media translation of condolence messages show evidence of calques and literal translation in Turkish. The types of calques detected were calques of collocations, preposition, subcategorization modification and relexification. The problematic collocants are underlined, accompanied by the alternative standard forms in Turkish below.

Calques of collocations

- "We condemn tonight's cowardly attack, and salute the courage of the Turkish people as we stand with them against terror...1". (US Embassy, Tweet)

"Bu geceki korkak saldırıyı kınıyor, teröre karşı yanında yer aldığımız Türk halkının cesaretine saygı duyuyoruz.²"

Analysis: "korkak saldırı" derives from the English "cowardly attack", while a standard form would be "alçak/hain saldırı".

- "We <u>unequivocally</u> condemn the barbaric deadly terrorist attack carried out at an Istanbul nightclub" ... "We express our undivided support for the Turkish people and address our <u>sincere</u> <u>condolences</u> to the families of the victims, ...³". (Greek Foreign Ministry's announcement)

"İstanbul'da bir gece kulübünde düzenlenen, çok sayıda kişinin hayatını kaybettiği barbarca terör saldırısını kesin şekilde kınıyoruz... hayatını kaybedenlerin ailelerine samimi şekilde başsağlığı, ...4"

Analysis: "kesin şekilde" derives from the English "unequivocally". "Kesin bir şekilde" would be more natural in use but not an established collocation with "kınamak" (condemn). A standard form would be "şiddetle kınıyoruz."

"Samimi şekilde başsağlığı" derives from the English "our sincere condolences". Actually, the addition of the word "samimi" (sincere) would make the utterance itself sound "insincere"." içtenlikle" or "kalbi" başsağlığı dileklerimizi sunuyor ..." would be more natural.

- "We share the same sadness and feelings with you because of <u>this disgusting crime</u> and declare the Iraqi people's solidarity with the friendly Turkish people against the risk of terrorism⁵". (Iraqi President Fuat Masum, in his message of condolence)

"Bu iğrenç suçtan dolayı sizlerle aynı üzüntü ve duyguları paylaşırken, terör riskine karşı Irak halkının dost Türk halkıyla tam dayanışmasını bildiriyoruz⁶".

Analysis: "iğrenç suç" derives from the English "disgusting crime" A standard form would be "hain saldırı".

- "...Our common duty is to <u>respond</u> decisively <u>to</u> the terrorist aggression⁷." (President of Russia, Putin, statement)

"Ortak görevimiz terörist saldırganlığına kararlı bir biçimde yanıt vermektir.8"

¹ http://www.ksdk.com/ext/news/nation-now//article/63/cqoZflqh1uocaSQaaySYQ

² http://www.internethaber.com/hain-saldiri-sonrasi-abd-ve-avrupadan-ilk-aciklama-1737875h.htm

³ http://www.ekathimerini.com/214957/article/ekathimerini/news/greek-foreign-ministry-condemns-deadly-new-years-attack-in-istanbul

⁴ http://bianet.org/bianet/insan-haklari/182266-ortakoy-de-yilbasi-saldirisina-dunyadan-tepkiler

⁵ http://aa.com.tr/en/turkey/world-condemns-istanbul-terror-attack/704279?amp=1

⁶ http://www.haberler.com/istanbul-daki-teror-saldirisina-tepkiler-9052015-haberi/

⁷ https://sputniknews.com/politics/201701011049175522-putin-condolences-istanbul-attack/

⁸ http://www.mansethaber.com/putin-ortak-gorevimiz-terorist-saldirganligina-kararli-bir-bicimde-yanit-vermektir/23438/

Analysis: "Yanıt vermek" derives from the English word "respond to". It actually fails to give the intended meaning as the multiple word is used to mean simply "give an answer" without the implication of "retaliation" which is what is meant in the sentence above. The standard Turkish would be "...karşılık vermektir."

- "Reina attack: We are <u>deeply shocked</u> and mourn with the people of #Istanbul, #Turkey⁹". (German Foreign Office, Tweet)

"Derin bir dehşet içindeyiz...10".

Analysis: "Derin bir dehşet", derives from the English "deeply shocked" A standard form would be "büyük bir üzüntü".

- "On behalf of the people of Azerbaijan and on my own behalf, I extend <u>my deepest condolences</u> to you, the bereaved families, loved ones of those who died and the brotherly people of Turkey, ...¹¹". (President of Azerbaijan İlhan Aliyev, on his website)

"Ortaya çıkmış olan facia ile ilgili kederinizi paylaşır, size, hayatını kaybedenlerin aileleri ve yakınlarına, kardeş Türkiye halkına kendim ve Azerbaycan halkı adına <u>derin hüzünle</u> başsağlığı diler, ...¹²".

Analysis: "derin hüzün" derives from the English adjectival phrase "my deepest condolences". In Turkish, "derin hüzün" is not needed nor used, but in English, "one's deep(est) condolences" is an established pattern.

- "Canada offers its condolences to families of victims and wishes a <u>speedy recovery</u> to those injured in tonight's horrendous attack in Istanbul¹³". (Canadian Foreign Minister, Dion, Twitter)

"Kanada, İstanbul'daki feci saldırının kurbanlarının ailelerine başsağlığı ve yaralılara <u>süratle</u> <u>iyileşmeleri</u> dileklerini sunmaktadır¹⁴" dedi.

Analysis: "süratle" derives from the English word "speedy". It is not observed in the diplomatic condolence messages; an alternative would be "bir an önce".

- "...such heinous acts aimed at undermining Turkey's peace, <u>stability</u>, progress and internal harmony would never <u>succeed¹⁵</u>". (Pakistan Foreign Ministry, statement)

"Hain terör saldırıları kardeş Türkiye'nin istikrarını yıkamayacak16".

Analysis: "istikrarını yıkamayacak" derives from the English stability, …would never succeed". In Turkish, the established collocation would be "…istikrarını bozamayacak".

15 http://www.dha.com.tr/dunya-ortakoydeki-hain-saldiriyi-boyle-gordu_1426779.htmlhttp://www.korkusuzmedya.com/dunya/azerbaycan-ve-pakistan-dan-istanbul-saldirisina-sert-tepki-h148377.html

⁹ https://twitter.com/germanydiplo

¹⁰ http://www.sabah.de/gundem/2017/01/01/dunyadan-turkiyeye-dayanisma-mesajlari

¹¹ http://azertag.az/en/xeber/President_Ilham_Aliyev_offers_condolences_to_Turkish_counterpart_over_Istanbul_nightclub_ attack-1024019

¹² http://www.dha.com.tr/dunya-ortakoydeki-hain-saldiriyi-boyle-gordu_1426779.html

¹³ http://www.londragazete.com/2017/01/05/the-queen-sends-message-of-condolence-to-president-of-turkey

¹⁴ http://www.dha.com.tr/dunya-ortakoydeki-hain-saldiriyi-boyle-gordu_1426779.html

¹⁶ http://www.dailysabah.com/turkey/2017/01/01/world-leaders-condemn-istanbul-nightclub-attack

Calque of prepositions

- "...We share your grief <u>over</u> this tragedy...¹⁷". (Azerbaijani President Aliyev, statement on his website)

"Ortaya çıkmış olan facia <u>ile ilgili</u> kederinizi paylaşır, size, hayatını kaybedenlerin aileleri ve yakınlarına, kardeş Türkiye halkına kendim ve Azerbaycan halkı adına derin hüzünle başsağlığı diler, yaralananlara şifa dilerim¹⁸".

Analysis: "Ortaya çıkmış olan facia ile ilgili kederinizi..." derives from "Your grief over this tragedy". The problem lies in the use of postposition "ilgili", deriving from the preposition "over". A standard form would be "facia karşısındaki acınızı..." or "faciadan dolayı duyduğunuz acıyı ..."

Calques of Subcategorization Modification

- "It is hard to <u>imagine</u> a more cynical crime than the murder of innocent civilians in the midst of New Year's holiday...Our common duty is to respond decisively to the terrorist aggression¹⁹". (President of Russia, Putin, statement)

"Yılbaşı kutlamalarının ortasında masum insanların öldürülmesinden daha kötücül bir suçu <u>hayalde canlandırmak</u> çok zor... Ortak görevimiz terörist saldırganlığına kararlı bir biçimde yanıt vermektir²⁰".

Analysis: The word "imagine" is translated into Turkish as "hayalinde canlandırmak" or "hayal etmek". By replacing "hayalinde canlandırmak" with "hayalde canlandırmak", the translation distorted the grammatical reflexive aspect of the verb. In standard Turkish, two alternatives would be "…suçu hayalimizde canlandırmak…" or "…suçu "hayal etmek…"

Calques of Relexification/Literal translation

- "...and mourn with the people of #Istanbul, #Turkey²¹". (German Foreign Office, Twitter)

"Üzüntülerimiz İstanbul'daki insanlarla beraber22".

"...<u>My thoughts are with the Turkish people</u> after the cowardly act of terrorism in the Reina night club attack²³". (UK Foreign Minister, Johnson, Twitter)

^{17 (}http://azertag.az/en/xeber/President_Ilham_Aliyev_offers_condolences_to_Turkish_counterpart_over_Istanbul_nightclub_ attack-1024019)

¹⁸ http://www.dha.com.tr/dunya-ortakoydeki-hain-saldiriyi-boyle-gordu_1426779.html

¹⁹ https://sputniknews.com/politics/201701011049175522-putin-condolences-istanbul-attack/

²⁰ http://www.mansethaber.com/putin-ortak-gorevimiz-terorist-saldirganligina-kararli-bir-bicimde-yanit-vermektir/23438/

²¹ https://twitter.com/germanydiplo

²² http://www.sabah.de/gundem/2017/01/01/dunyadan-turkiyeye-dayanisma-mesajlari

²³ http://www.londragazete.com/2017/01/05/the-queen-sends-message-of-condolence-to-president-of-turkey/

"İstanbul'da bir gece kulübüne düzenlenen alçakça terör saldırısının ardından düşüncelerimiz Türkiye ile birliktedir²⁴".

- "... <u>Our thoughts are with victims and their loved ones²⁵</u>". (EU High Representative Mogherini, statement)

"...Kalbim hayatını kaybedenler ve sevdikleriyle26".

- "Our hearts are with the Turkish people at this difficult time²⁷". (Israeli President Rivlin, Twitter)

- "Kalplerimiz, Türk halkıyla birliktedir28".

- "...<u>My thoughts this morning are with the victims, their families and friends²⁹</u>". (German Prime Minister Merkel, statement)

"...Bu sabah aklımız; kurbanlar, onların aileleri ve dostlarında³⁰".

Analysis: These last five statements are taken as examples, based on the English pattern "We mourn with/ My/Our thoughts/hearts are with (the recipients of the condolence message)". This form is so common in our corpus, we include here only those with different wording. These are well-established sentential patterns in English condolence messages but their literal translations are not common in Turkish diplomatic condolence messages. Regarding the replacement of "aklımız" (back translation, being our minds), deriving from "my thoughts", in Turkish, a semantic shift happens. The general field of use is for worrisome situations, not as an offer of sympathy. As for the replacement of "düşüncelerimiz" with "kalbimiz" as in the translation of Rivlin's and Mogherini's condolence correspondence, this is generally observed in less formal oral and written comforting remarks, rather than official correspondences. The word "beraber" or "birlikte" deriving from the English "with" as in "with victims and their loved ones" above is redundant in Turkish, and introducing some awkwardness into the sentence. All these sentences replace the standard form of "hayatını kaybedenlerin ailesi/ yakınları/ Türk halkına (depending on recipients of condolences in the relevant statement of the original message) başsağlığı dileklerimizi sunuyoruz/ dileklerini sunar."

"It was supposed to be a night of celebration: terrorists turned it into one of violence, death, despair...³¹". (EP president, Schulz, Twitter)

²⁴ http://www.dha.com.tr/dunya-ortakoydeki-hain-saldiriyi-boyle-gordu_1426779.html

²⁵ http://www.dha.com.tr/dunya-ortakoydeki-hain-saldiriyi-boyle-gordu_1426779.html

²⁶ http://bianet.org/bianet/insan-haklari/182266-ortakoy-de-yilbasi-saldirisina-dunyadan-tepkiler

²⁷ http://aa.com.tr/en/todays-headlines/world-condemns-istanbul-nightclub-attack/717936

²⁸ http://www.hurriyet.com.tr/istanbuldaki-saldiriya-dunyadan-tepki-yagiyor-40323385

²⁹ http://www.citynews.ca/2017/01/01/the-latest-canadian-among-dead-istanbul-nightclub-attack-turkish-media-report-says/

³⁰ http://www.sabah.de/gundem/2017/01/01/dunyadan-turkiyeye-dayanisma-mesajlari

³¹ https://twitter.com/martinschulz

"Bir kutlama gecesi olması gerekiyordu. Teröristler, şiddet, ölüm ve ümitsizlik gecesine dönüştürdü...³²".

Analysis: The sentential pattern has been reproduced literally in the TL, resulting in an awkward and unnatural text. By omitting "it" in the Turkish translation, the emphasis was lost. A standard form would be "Bir kutlama gecesi olacaktı, ancak terör geceye şiddet, ölüm ve ümitsizlik getirdi".

"We share the same sadness and feelings with you because of this disgusting crime and declare <u>the Iraqi people's solidarity with the friendly Turkish people</u> against the risk of terrorism.³³". (Iraqi President Masum in his message of condolence)

"Bu iğrenç suçtan dolayı sizlerle aynı üzüntü ve duyguları paylaşırken, terör riskine karşı <u>Irak</u> <u>halkının dost Türk halkıyla tam dayanışmasını</u> bildiriyoruz³⁴".

Analysis: The noun phrase "tam dayanışma" deriving from the literal translation of "full solidarity" in English in the message above would mean inTurkish that Iraqi people are already in solidarity, which may not well be true in the sense President attributed to it; nevertheless, what is actually emphasized in the original is that they remain in solidarity or will be in full solidarity, which is a typical pattern of an offer of assistance, generally observed in such messages. Therefore, to convey the intended meaning, a verb to collocate with "tam dayanışma" is lacking. The standard form would be "tam dayanışma halinde/içinde olduğunu/olacağını".

- "<u>We share the same sadness and feelings with you</u> because of this disgusting crime and declare the Iraqi people's full solidarity with the friendly Turkish people against the risk of terrorism.³⁵". (Iraqi President Fuat Masum in his message of condolence)

"Bu iğrenç suçtan dolayı <u>sizlerle aynı üzüntü ve duyguları paylaşırken</u>, terör riskine karşı Irak halkının dost Türk halkıyla tam dayanışmasını bildiriyoruz³⁶".

Analysis: The Turkish translation "... sizlerle aynı üzüntü ve duyguları paylaşırken, ...", derives from the first part of the original sentence, which is, "we share the same sadness and feelings with you..." A standard form would omit the word "same" and bring a possessive pronoun before sadness and feelings in Turkish, which would appear as "...üzüntünüzü paylaşıyor, ..."

In addition, "sizlerle" deriving from "with you", is not a diplomatic form of address. The established pattern in Turkish would be "Ekselanslarının (Zat-ı Alilerinin üzüntülerini paylaşıyor, …" As it is seen in the translation, Turkish third plural form is used to address the high level statespeople.

All these unconventional uses in register mentioned in this section are grammatically correct, but are unnatural forms of diplomatic language

³² http://www.ntv.com.tr/dunya/putin-terore-yanit-vermek-ortak-gorevimiz,avRU891YQkiHjuPj55RjVA

³³ http://aa.com.tr/en/turkey/world-condemns-istanbul-terror-attack/704279?amp=1

³⁴ http://www.haberler.com/istanbul-daki-teror-saldirisina-tepkiler-9052015-haberi/

³⁵ http://aa.com.tr/en/turkey/world-condemns-istanbul-terror-attack/704279?amp=1

³⁶ http://www.haberler.com/istanbul-daki-teror-saldirisina-tepkiler-9052015-haberi/

Conclusions

This study focused on the register of rarely discussed text type, condolence messages. Firstly, unique features of macrostructure and register were analyzed. Then, taking a functionalist approach, the unconventional uses in Turkish media translations released in the wake of the attack to Reina night club in İstanbul, Turkey during the New Year Eve's celebrations, 2017 were grouped and analyzed according to Silva-Corvalán's (1994) classification, and presented with their standard diplomatic manifestations. Silva-Corvalán called the unconventional uses "innovative", as her corpus stems from the phenomenon of interlanguage of English-Spanish, due to contact zones of geographical proximity. In our case, the diplomatic register, which is well-established, was violated, and it cannot therefore qualify as innovative. The Turkish translations studied here can at best be defined as unnatural and no longer functional. It was stated at the beginning of the article that diplomatic language is characterized by established patterns, making up a unique register, and therefore it cannot serve its function without such conventional uses/patterns. The features of the media translation, explored in Literature Review, revealed that there is no autonomous "translator's intervention". Media translation is a collective process and product, it can thus be readily claimed that "transediting" teams do not seem to have paid due attention to features of diplomatic language.

It would be interesting to consider the effects on the readership of such news. The unconventional uses in the analyzed translations give to the diplomatic readership the impression that the translations were not supervised and edited in light of diplomatic language conventions. These examples would mislead the lay person about how diplomatic condolence messages are written. For the layperson, unaware of the diplomatic language proper, the more the same calque is repeated, the more natural and acceptable they may appear. In addition, as the findings confirm one of the conclusions of Silva-Corvalán (1994) that "Calques rarely break grammatical rules of either language, which requires a higher level of proficiency" in the languages studied, the lay person would probably fail to notice those unconventional uses in Turkish translations, and receive a misleading impression about the Turkish diplomatic language.

This study indicates that calques and literal translation, being an apparently easy solution as a translation procedure, while occasionally providing acceptable forms, do not generally offer sound results, especially when it comes to "sensitive" and "well-established pattern" texts as in the case of diplomatic texts. Unconventional uses lack recognition, and can, in no way, be treated as innovative in diplomatic circles. This also has some implications for present and future diplomatic translators. In training, translators should be taught and reminded of the importance of macrostructure and register of these texts through examples. The data collected for this study may be suitable for translator training classes in undergraduate programs for illustrations of undesirable linguistic shifts. Further studies can be conducted to identify other diplomatic texts through translations, which can be used for means, i.e. data, and ends i.e. translation practice and training.

References

- Abu Jaber, S.A. (2001). Language and diplomacy. In J.Kurbalija and H. Slavik (Eds.), *Language and Diplomacy* (pp.49-54). Malta: Mediterranean Academy of Diplomatic Studies.
- Bassnett, S. (2011). The translator as a cultural mediator. In K. Malmkjær and K. Windle (Eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of Translation Studies* (pp.94-108). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bassnett, S., and Schäffner, C. (2010). Introduction-Politics, media and translation: Exploring synergies. In C. Schäffner and S. Bassnett (Eds.), *Political Discourse, Media and Translation* (pp.1-29). GBR: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Behnam, B., Hamed, Ali Akbari, L. F., and Goharkhani A. (2013). An investigation of giving condolences in English and Persian via short messages. *Procedia–Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 70: 1679–1685.
- Bivin, A. (2013). *Mi madre es cuatro pies: A study of the use of calques in Hondurans and Salvadorans in Southern Louisiana*. Unpublished Master Thesis, Morehead State University, USA.
- Braga, R., and Domínguez, E. (2010). Structural calques: source language interference in CLIL lectures in Spain. Retrieved January 17, 2017 from <u>https://anglistik.univie.ac.at/fileadmin/user_upload/dep_anglist/weitere_Uploads/Views/views1903CLILspecial.pdf</u>.
- Bruce, D. I., and Douglas, A. A. (2008). News Writing and Reporting. Boston: McGraw-Hill International Edition.
- Bulut, A. (2015). Tercüme Hatası!? İstanbul: Çeviribilim Yayınları.

Bulut, A. (2008). Basından Örneklerle Çeviride İdeoloji İdeolojik Çeviri. İstanbul: Multilingual.

- Chansou, M. (1984). Calques et créations linguistiques, META 29,3: 281-285.
- Chesterman, A. (1998). Contrastive Functional Analysis. Amsterdam and Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Elwood, K. (2004). "I am so sorry": A Cross-Cultural Analysis of Expression of Condolence (pp.49-74). [Electronic version]. Retrieved January, 12, 2017 from http://dspace.wul.waseda.ac.jp/dspace/handle/ 2065/6087? Mode=full.
- Fenton-Smith, B. (2007). Diplomatic condolences: Ideological positioning in the death of Yasser Arafat. Discourse and Society. 18,6: 697–718.
- Garnier, M. and Saint-Dizier, P. (2009). An Analysis of the calque phenomena based on comparable corpora. Retrieved January 14, from <u>https://www.irit.fr/~Patrick.Saint-Dizier/publi_fichier/paraPSD.pdf</u>
- Kayyal, M. (2008). Interference of the Hebrew language in translations from modern Hebrew literature into Arabic. In A. Pym, M. Schlesinger and D. Simeoni (Eds.), *Beyond Descriptive Translation Studies. Investigations in homage to Gideon Toury*. (pp.33-50). John Benjamins: Netherlands.
- Kuang, C.H. (2015). Functions of Malaysian condolences written in text messages. Pertanika J. Soc. Sci. and Hum. 23,2, 479-493.
- Lotfollahi, B., and Eslami-Rasekh, A. (2011). Speech act of condolence in Persian and English: A crosscultural study. *Journal of Studies in Literature and Language*, *3*, *3*, 139-145.
- Munday, J. (2001). Introducing Translation Studies. London/ New York: Routledge.
- Nicholson, H. (1950). Diplomacy. London: Oxford University Press.
- Nord, C. (1997). Translating as a purposeful activity: Functionalist approaches explained (Translation Theories *Explored*). Routledge.
- Odlin, T. (1993). Language Transfer: Cross-linguistic influence in language learning. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Polat, Y. (2015). Doğrudan çeviri yöntemleri ve reddetme söz edimi uygunlaştırıcıları. Çeviribilim ve Uygulamaları, 21: 23-42.
- Pym, A. (2014). Vinay and Darbelnet and the politics of translation solutions. Retrieved January 14, 2017 from http://usuaris.tinet.cat/apym/on-line/translation/2014_vinay_darbelnet.pdf.
- Reiss, K. (1977/1989). Text types, translation types and translation assessment, translated by.A. Chesterman. In A.Chesterman (1989), *Readings in translation theory* (pp. 105-115) Helsinki: Oy Finn Lectura.
- Samavarchi, L., and Allami, H. (2012). Giving condolences by Persian EFL learners: A contrastive sociopragmatic study. *International Journal of English Linguistics*, 2,1, 71-78.
- Schäffner, C. (2007). Political communication-mediated by translation. English as a lingua franca of diplomacy. Conference of Political Linguistics. Book of Abstracts, Warsaw University Institute of Applied Linguistics. Sewell, P. (2001). The occurrence of calque in translation scripts. *META*, 46,3: 607-615.
- Shuttleworth, M., and Cowie, M. (2007). Dictionary of Translation Studies. Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing.

Silva-Corvalán, C. (1994). Language Contact and Change: Spanish in Los Angeles. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- Stetting, K. (1989). Transediting- A new term for coping with a gray area between editing and translating. In G. Caie, K.Haastrup, A. L. Jakobsen et al (Eds.), Proceedings of the fourth Nordic Conference for English Studies (pp. 371-382) Copenhagen: University of Copenhagen.
- Tareq, M. M. (2013). May Allah not let you experience another sorrow: Condolence strategies used by lecturers who are native speakers of Arabic L1 toward their colleague who is native speaker of Hebrew in Hebrew L2. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 3,3, 17-22.
- Tulun, B. (1996). Diplomatik Yazışma ve Konuşma Metinlerinden Örnekler. Ankara: Dışişleri Eğitim Merkezi Yayınları no.68.
- Van Doorslaer, L. (2010) Journalism and translation. In Y. Gambier and L.van Doorslaer (Eds.), Handbook of Translation Studies 1 (pp.180-184). Amsterdam/ Philadephia: John Benjamins.
- Vinay, J.P., and Darbelnet, J. (1958/1972). *Stylistique comparée du français et de l'anglais: méthode de traduction*. Paris: Didier.
- Yahya, E. M. (2010). A study of condolences in Iraqi Arabic with reference to English. *Adab Al- Rafidayn*, 57: 47-70.

Yetkin Karakoç, N. (2016). Çeviri ve Diplomasi. İstanbul: Çeviribilim Yayınları.

Yetkin, Karakoç, N. (2014). Structural calques in neologism translation and unintelligibility: The case of Generation X. Turkish Studies, 9,3: 1611-1619.